City of Eau Claire Plan Commission Minutes Meeting of September 19, 2016

City Hall, Council Chambers

7:00 p.m.

Members Present:

Messrs. Brenholt, Granlund, Larsen, Seymour, Pederson, Radabaugh, Weld

Ms. Ebert and Ms. Mitchell

Staff Present:

Messrs. Tufte, Genskow, Chwala, Petrie

The meeting was chaired by Mr. Weld.

1. <u>CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT (CZ-1618)</u> – Bed & Breakfast, 132 Marston Avenue

Mr. Tufte presented a conditional use permit request to allow for a bed and breakfast consisting of three guest rooms for property located at 132 Marston Avenue. The property is a large landmarked home having unique character and historic value. No additions to the structure are proposed and the appearance of the dwelling will be maintained. He noted that the applicants will be living at the home and are proposing to add three parking stalls for their guests.

Applicant, Jerome Kachmar, is looking to purchase the home and thought this was a good fit for the area. He noted last week, he met with the Third Ward Neighborhood and received support.

Kevin Rosenberg, 219 McKinley Avenue, spoke in support from the neighborhood association.

Anton Smets, 28 Newton Street spoke in support of the project and feels it is a good use for the home. He noted that it is important that the property will be owner occupied.

Steve Immerman, 120 Marston Avenue, spoke in support and stated this was a good use for the property.

Mr. Larsen moved to approve the conditional use permit. Seconded by Ms. Ebert and motion carried.

2. CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT (CZ-1619) – Detached garage, 4345 Meadow Lane

Mr. Tufte presented a conditional use permit request to allow for a detached garage that is in excess of accessory use standards for property at 4345 Meadow Lane. The existing home has a 23' x 23' attached garage with a proposed 40' x 44' detached garage. The combination of these two garages is in excess of the accessory use of 1,500 square foot garage area. This particular neighborhood has larger lots than most single family lots in the city with approximately 0.97 acres. It appears many of the trees are maintained with the new garage.

Jason Coffey, son of the owner and applicant, stated his dad would like to have more storage for vehicles and trailers that are currently in front of the house.

Jeff Letkiewicz, 4351 Meadow Lane, property owner to the south, spoke in support of the project.

Mr. Pederson moved to approve the conditional use permit. Ms. Mitchell seconded and motion carried.

3. <u>SITE PLAN (SP-1629)</u> –Apartment, 500 Block of 1st Avenue

Mr. Tufte presented a request to approve a site plan for one 5-unit and one 6-unit apartment on the 500 block of 1st Avenue. The site plan notes each building as having 2, 3, and 4-bedroom units with 35 total bedrooms. The Commission postponed consideration of this site plan to allow time for applicant to meet with the neighborhood association and discuss changes to the building façade of the project. The revised building design provides a more historical look for the building and has added front porches. The site plan shows a 27-stall parking area to the rear of both buildings with direct access off the alley. A letter from the Historic Randall Park Neighborhood is attached to the staff report. Another letter was submitted from a resident living in the neighborhood.

Alex Padrnos with JCAP Real Estate spoke in support of the project and stated the redesign is more historic looking and what the neighborhood was looking for.

Helene Smiar, 320 Broadway Street, President of the Historic Randall Park Neighborhood stated that the neighborhood association does not support the project because of the size and height of the structures. She noted concern about the lack of parking for the new apartments and the amount of density this project would be replacing.

Jeff DeGrave, 133 Lake Street, does not support the project and believes that space and density is not compatible to the area. He stated that the height of the proposed buildings is over the average height of the existing homes in the 500 block of 1st Avenue.

Ms. Mitchell expressed concerns about the building mass, scale and density of the project compared to the other homes along 1st Avenue. She noted that 1st Avenue is an important corridor into historic Randall Park neighborhood.

The Commission members held a discussion about the site plan and proposed apartments.

Ms. Ebert moved to approve to the site plan with the conditions of the staff report. Mr. Radabaugh seconded and the motion failed 3-6. Ms. Mitchell, Mr. Larsen, Mr. Brenholt, Mr. Granlund, Mr. Seymour, Mr. Weld voted nay.

4. <u>SITE PLAN (SP-1640)</u> – Seven Duplexes, West of Brookline Avenue and North of Clearwater Ridge Drive; and

PRELIMINARY PLAT (P-4-16) - Condo Plat, Clearwater Ridge Drive

Mr. Tufte presented a request to approve a site plan for seven duplexes and a preliminary condo plat for Clearwater Ridge Drive. The site plan shows seven duplexes with access to a private drive. The applicant states it would be difficult to develop this with buildings facing Brookline Avenue due to steep grades on the site. The developer prefers to develop the site with walkout units that have a view from the site to the east. He noted this design creates a number of issues with the policies of the Multi-Family Housing Design Manual such as the design of these buildings provides a front entry but no egress-sized window viewable from the street. The Commission has allowed this design with the past four-plex phases of this project in that they were built prior to the policy or in that the buildings did not face the street.

Applicant, Bob Janke, 4328 S. Lowes Creek Road, stated previous Plan Commissions have approved this design and this is the final phase of the master plan development for this subdivision.

Mr. Pederson moved to postpone the site plan to address staff concerns. Seconded by Ms. Mitchell and motion carried.

5. <u>DISCUSSION/DIRECTION</u>

A. Street Trees

Mr. Tufte stated that the Comprehensive Plan identifies two 2016 tasks in the Plan Implementation chapter concerning street trees: street tree practice and street tree plan. A street tree is a tree planted within the boulevard area of the public right-of-way which is usually the area between the street and sidewalk. Currently, site plan review is required for all new development within the city other than single-family homes. He noted the gaps in our present system and some recommended changes to code. He noted three different options to get street trees planted for new single-family dwellings.

- B. Code Compliance Items None.
- C. Future Agenda Items None.
- D. Additions or Corrections to Minutes None.

6. MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting of September 6, 2016 were approved.

Jamie Radabaugh, Secretary